

Digital Transformation of Judicial System in Pakistan: An Analysis of scope and concerns for a better future



Sundus Rauf	Assistant Professor, College of Law, The University of Lahore sundas.rauf@law.uol.edu.pk
Mian Tariq Javed	Assistant Professor, College of Law, The University of Lahore
Sobia Sifarish	Lecturer, College of Law, The University of Lahore

Abstract: *Technological innovations have revolutionized every domain of human life and the legal side of society is no exception. AI has brought digital transformation to Pakistan's judicial system through its tools, software, and systems. The world is a global village now due to the advent of modern tech-based mechanisms. Countries have digitalized their justice administration process making access to justice easy by facilitating litigants, attorneys, and judicial actors. Advanced databases of routine cases, judicial precedents, e-filing, e-evidence, e-courts, criminal profiling, data management systems, digital documentation, documentary review, crime mapping, digital surveillance, etc. have brought significant changes for providing speedy relief to aggrieved people. This research is intended to analyze the extent of digital advancement in Pakistan's judicial system. Because it is a developed country, Pakistan lacks the necessary resources, digital infrastructure, expert human capital, and finance. Therefore, several challenges need to be addressed through strategic plans. This study is also highlighting the various barriers in this regard. Researchers have relied upon information collected from secondary sources by using qualitative research methodology and applying an analytical approach after exploring relevant facts. The research has concluded with certain recommendations for timely and impactful policy-making to make Pakistan a better and sustainable place to live under the rule of law.*

Keywords: Digital Transformation, AI, Judicial System, Pakistan, Scope, Challenges

Introduction

Countries worldwide are using artificial intelligence (AI) to facilitate their judicial system and streamline the process of justice administration to provide speedy relief. Advancements through AI have enabled us to analyze large amounts of legal data to help lawyers identify precedents in case law, record keeping, criminal profiling, and supporting judges with predictions on issues including sentence duration and recidivism scores. The potential of AI has already been identified in various areas of the judicial system including the judiciary, prosecution services, investigation

process, and automated decision-making process (UNESCO, 2023). Digital transformation has facilitated the system by introducing facial recognition technology, criminal profiling, advancements in investigation, digital forensics, crime mapping, digital surveillance, digital research, databases, and online courtrooms (Rauf, Rana, Anees, Ashraf, & Sifarish, 2023).

The judicial system of Pakistan is facing several challenges starting from crime reporting to the final disposal of cases (Rauf, Seed, & Zahid, 2020). Sometimes it results either in false acquittals or false convictions or delays in the

administration of justice due to procedural lacunas leaving an impression of denial of justice in Pakistan (Rauf, Ashraf, & Sifarish, 2024). A rapid rise in cases of sexual abuse has also been noted with a major number of unreported cases the reason for which is only the procedural flaws of the system including inefficient and non-victim-supported investigation, lack of criminal profiling with updated records, lacking appropriate arrangements in providing supportive arrangements for handling traumatized victim and the family ensuring privacy of the matter, quick decision-making following accurate forensic investigation and efficient proceedings (Zahid & Rauf, 2021).

The judicial system of Pakistan needs to be reformed through the integration of AI and technological advancements but requires prodigious effort and massive investment of resources. Pakistan is a developing country and is facing several internal and external challenges with continuous efforts to counter the same since its creation (Zahid & Rauf, 2021). Its geopolitical importance raises its regional and global strategic importance and at the same time demands huge levels of advancements for providing security and ensuring the rule of law. The only solution to all the problems is to seek help from technology by integrating AI to expedite access to justice and to secure a better and socio-economically sustainable future for Pakistan.

Field of Law and Technological Advancement

Digital transformation in the judicial system has brought revolutionary changes through generative AI, Natural Language Processing (NLP), and Machine Learning (ML) (Garg, 2024). AI-powered software and tools are widely being used for legal documentation and contract writing e.g. *IronClad*, *Genei AI*, *Robin AI*, *Juro*, *Carillis*, *Spellbook*, *Grammarly*, etc. These tools also help in voice assistance for dictation, language translation, and document management. The AI-powered draft analyzer is used to maintain the standards of the document according to the requirements (Jerry, 2024). AI-powered contract management tools along with

AI-generated language models save law professionals from the laborious work of manual documentation by preparing the same through an automated system (Jerry, 2024). The use of AI in *e-discovery* helps lawyers search any document out of bulk data through an algorithm, process automation, text analytics, etc. whereas *LexisNexis*, *Westlaw*, *Thomas Reuter's AI tool*, *Chatbot*, *ChatGPT*, *Casetext*, and other tools are assisting in providing legal review, answering legal questions and generating summaries based on available information from various jurisdictions (Jerry, 2024). Attorneys and litigants are seeking help through predictive analytics for forecasting legal outcomes of the case, predicting cost and estimated time, and identifying potential risks. Courts also seek help by using AI-based criminal risk assessment programs to determine certain risks about offenders before releasing them on bail, probation, or parole (BloombergLaw, 2024). Virtual assistance and online advisory services have provided a convenient mode to the attorneys and the clients for communication thereby saving their time and money. Another technological innovation is the introduction of AI-driven smart courts for *e-filing*, *e-hearing*, and *e-decisions* during litigation and online dispute resolution (ODR) for resolving disputes through alternate modes. In 2017 *Hangzhou Internet Court of China* was established where the court procedure is conducted by AI judges who make their appearance as synthesized 3D images of humans through hologram technology and ask questions, schedule cases, hear parties, record evidence and announce judgments. Many other countries including Canada, Germany, France, Croatia, etc are using AI-assisted courts to dispose of the matter involving less legal complexity (Laptev & Feyzrakhmanova, 2024).

Digital Transformation of the Judicial System of Pakistan

AI is revolutionizing various aspects of human lives and the legal system is no exception. AI holds an enormous potential to augment the efficacy and impact of our legal system including the courts by streamlining the processes, automating workflows, and enhancing accessibility (Barkved, 2024). In the

recent past, the judicial system of Pakistan was very outdated with least reforms and technological advancements. Fortunately, the government and the representatives of the judicial system are feeling the need for time after assessing the current situation of the rule of law and access to justice prevailing in the country. It has been realized that to stand among the global community, it is vital to adopt digital means for speedy justice and reducing crimes. During a few previous years, a notable transformative shift has been witnessed in the legal landscape of Pakistan due to technological innovations (Awais, 2023).

AI-powered analytics has revolutionized legal research and analysis of case law through machine learning algorithms which can swiftly extract relevant case laws, precedents, and statutes from vast databases (Awais, 2023). Domains of cyber security and data privacy have also emerged as evaluative concerns during this digital age as the need to safeguard sensitive information is paramount for online legal platforms and digital documentation. Confidentiality and integrity in legal proceedings have been ensured through a secure cloud system and compliance management system (Awais, 2023).

The development of an online Case Management System (CMS) is another revolutionary step that has been taken by the courts to track the status of cases (Marques, 2024). This software provides information and services regarding cause list, case hearing status, e-courts, a roster of judges, mediation centers, and court maps. This management system has been made available digitally to the district courts (CFMS, 2024), apex courts (Lahore High Court, 2024) (High Court of Sindh, 2024), Revenue Board (BOR, 2024), Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan (DRA, 2024), Federal Investigation Agency (FIA, 2024), etc.

A notable change through digital transformation has been witnessed in the efficient working of FIA which has made access to justice for a common citizen of Pakistan more expeditious and effective through its portals including the FIA Complaint Portal and Cyber Crime Complaint Portal (FIA, 2024). Aggrieved people

have online access to these portals to lodge their complaints regarding any issue falling under the ambit of FIA (FIA, 2024). It has established various wings including anti-corruption, anti-human trafficking and smuggling, counter-terrorism, cybercrime, economic crime, integrated border management system, intellectual property rights, immigration, and Interpol (FIA, 2024). FIA is determined to provide speedy relief to its citizens through AI-assisted resources and trained officials. A complete digital and accessible database has also been created providing complete details and statistics about the complaints lodged, their status, and fate for final disposal (FIA, 2024).

Legal tech innovations have also reshaped effective communication and efficient teamwork among legal teams and judicial actors of our country through seamless interaction by using virtual collaboration tools, video conferencing platforms, and project management software irrespective of their locations (DeepL, 2024). Lawyers are more inclined to use this advancement to save their time and to become more accessible to their clients through virtual meetings on Skype, Google Meet, conference calls, etc. Clients also feel satisfied as these arrangements are more cost-effective, speedy, and fair (DeepL, 2024).

Technological innovations have also influenced our courts and judges who are ready to adopt advanced measures by synchronizing the traditional court system with modern technology thus introducing the hybrid system to expedite speedy justice for distant and poor citizens (Naurin & Ullah, 2023). The backlog of cases in our courts has reached 2.26 million cases according to the report issued by the Law and Justice Commission of Pakistan during the second half of the year 2023 (Dawn, 2024). A major reason for this pendency is the lower judges-to-citizens ratio as one judge is available for 62000 people. This problem can be solved through E-courts. The need for e-courts was realized during COVID-19 when the courts in Pakistan were not able to provide e-services to litigants due to a lack of required infrastructure (Naurin & Ullah, 2023). Although the first e-court system was launched by former Chief

Justice Asif Saeed Khosa, who examined witnesses through video link on Skype in July 2019, the judiciary is unable to make it a continuous practice due to poor internet facilities and lack of human as well as infrastructural resources (Naurin & Ullah, 2023).

The constitution of Pakistan, 1973 recognizes the right of privacy of its citizens as a fundamental right under Article 14 but at the same time, law enforcement and intelligence agencies are conducting strict surveillance of individuals after an increase in terrorism incidents particularly after terrorist attacks in Army Public School in Peshawar in 2016 (Iqbal, 2023). PTA-mandated Lawful Intercept Management System (LIMS) is authorized to retrieve data of consumers, eavesdrop on voice calls, and read SMSes (Abbas, 2024). This surveillance cannot be done without a proper legal framework and regulatory mechanism as mentioned by the apex courts of the country but PTA is doing so. The act of surveillance is being sheltered under the Fair Trial Act 2013 and the Prevention of Electronic Crime Act (PECA) 2016 which require prior permission of the court before infringing the privacy of any person (Abbas, 2024). This aspect though needs to be streamlined, but has provided technological measures for the detection of any illegal activities by apprehending and identifying through consumers' data.

Face Trace System (FTS) is another significant technological advancement introduced by the police in Pakistan which utilizes AI for creating a data bank of over 18 million individuals including suspects and criminals and helps police in locating accused and wanted criminals (Chaudhry, 2023). The system has been developed with compatibility with the latest AI measures for speedy arrests of criminals after accurate identification. Arrests have also been made by tracing suspects caught in CCTV cameras and other digital sources (Chaudhry, 2023). Through forensic DNA profiling of criminals, efforts are being made to control crimes (Jatoi, Khan, & Jatoi, 2021).

Challenges in Developing a Sustainable AI-Assisted Judicial System in Pakistan

The government of Pakistan is proactively gearing up to welcome the fourth industrial revolution which is evident from its endorsement of digitalization initiatives such as the National AI Draft Policy. Despite putting efforts into AI integration, Pakistan is facing numerous hurdles in adopting AI technologies and is ranking at position 92nd according to the Government AI Readiness Index significantly lagging behind other countries including the United States (1st), China (17th) and India (32nd) (Oxford Insights, 2023). The status is a result of lacking incorporation of ethical considerations, infrastructure aligned with global standards, navigation of political dynamics, and prioritization of data integrity and privacy protection (Pirzada, 2023).

For efficient and effective growth of AI and its integration into the judicial system, real-time and quality data is essential which must be received from reliable and authentic sources. The insufficient and controlled availability of quantified data raises concerns about the implementation of national policy concerning the justice system. The data collected during investigation, case filing, crime reporting, prosecution, or legal hearing is not properly recorded, administered, and digitally managed (Rauf, Seed, & Zahid, 2020). The fact results in inaccuracies in statistical information and maintenance of digital databases about case summaries and the details of victims, crimes, and criminals. Unreported cases add further problems in record keeping using technology (Zahid & Rauf, 2021).

Pakistani youth is full of potential and talent to acquire knowledge in every field and to cope with the emerging needs of technology. Massive brain drain in recent years is contributing towards our difficulties consequences of which will appear shortly when we will have to face a drastic drop down in human capital. A large pool of our young talented people decides to move abroad for a better future when they find no opportunities to survive and grow after completing their education. A greater number of youngsters who are left behind need education,

robust skills, and training to enable AI in the country but are lacking resources. Another number of young people are spoiling their tendencies by wasting their time abusing technology for gaming and social media apps. This dilemma of not using energies used in productive and society-building tasks is resulting in creating a huge gap in technological advancement. They can actively be inserted in various domains of law by creating opportunities and jobs.

The language barrier is causing another challenge in the digital transitioning of the judicial system. Our national language is Urdu (Article 251, 1973), which shares its status as an official and court language with English (WorldAtlas, 2019). People usually speak their mother tongue when they encounter some incident, report some event, or practice their routine life (Ahmed, 2022). As digital data needs to be kept in the official language which is English, therefore an issue arises in keeping notes and translating reported cases as well as documents. It results in a waste of resources and time while receiving first-hand information. AI solutions must also be tailored with the skills of translating rigorous research and data into different languages to disseminate local awareness.

Transparency, accountability, and privacy are the major concerns and ethical considerations that require a high level of data protection and security measures with regulatory framework and strict observation. At the present stage of early AI development in the judicial system of Pakistan, these areas are lacking. The data may be at risk if lands in the hands of criminals. There are risks of deliberate misinformation which may impact the decision-making process (Raja, 2023). Although Pakistan's National AI Policy (Draft Policy) was recently launched in 2023 by the Ministry of Information Technology & Telecom (MoITT), unfortunately, it has several loopholes that need to be cured at the earliest to achieve the desired goal in AI implementation. This policy alone is not sufficient to provide an effective legal framework for combating ethical considerations-related issues (Josh and Mack

International, 2023).

The significance of networking and communication infrastructure cannot be denied for AI integration into the judicial system. Pakistan's networking is highly insufficient and outdated. Slow internet speed and no internet facilities in far-flung and war-driven areas is a major obstacle in digitalizing judicial system. Partial implementation of AI tools in developed cities without necessary measures taken in less developed areas will not help in acquiring desired outcomes to meet international standards and achieve sustainability (Abid, 2024).

Our expertise in AI and its incorporated system is not sufficient to identify, analyze, and handle AI-associated risks. AI is supposed to work like human intelligence but in a judicial system where personalized opinion is needed, it can neither think like humans nor can it advise on its own. The AI algorithm is used to solve problems and provide legal advice based on data stored which requires a bulk of information to generate text, images, and videos. The risks of hallucination, lack of nuance, reliance on inaccurate information, and lack of personalization are always there (Flaxman Law Group, 2024).

Pakistan's legal system is associated with the implementation of Shari'ah law, common law, and customary laws. AI tools for legal research must contain complete and accurate information about sources of laws from these domains to avoid conflict in decision-making based on religion or ethnicity. It is also a major challenge for AI-driven research tool developers in our country.

Recommendation and Conclusion

1. The National AI Policy of Pakistan should be clearly defined with an effective strategic roadmap providing the feasibility to integrate technology into the socio-economic realm of society. The first of its four pillars should be focused on AI research and development instead of market enablement. There is a need for spreading awareness, readiness for this reformation, and adopting measures in all settings. Effective implementation of the national

policy and technological advancement through human resources and infrastructure may provide room for achieving the desired objective in our judicial system.

2. Pakistan is far behind in technology and human expertise in the relevant field of AI. This incapacity is creating an uneven topography with a digital gap that can only be filled through heavy investment in developing a compatible and sustainable digital ecosystem and capacity building of the respective individuals. It can be done through better strategies for attracting foreign direct investment which inversely depends upon the safest place for business purposes with the rule of law and access to justice. Pakistan can take leverage at this stage by working with China to acquire knowledge and financial means to import knowledge to establish digital infrastructure in the wake of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC).
3. Prioritizing digital strategic plans and digital infrastructure security are nevertheless less important than nuclear strategic plans and national security plans. The global future is now more concerned about handling cyber warfare which has no jurisdictional limits than securing the territorial boundaries only. The expectation of achieving the desired objective of even spreading awareness about AI among the public by spending less than two percent of the overall budget on education is not a realistic approach. The time frame provided in the policy is not workable as compared to the resource allocation and proposed strategic plan with the targets to be achieved by 2030. Without generalized and nationwide digital reforms, innovations, and promotions, the judicial system alone cannot be upgraded on its own. Massive advancement at the national level is mandatory in this regard.
4. Experts are needed to be hired to develop digital infrastructure in the field of law consisting of technology with the judicial actors equipped with the abilities to handle this system. This transition can be timely achieved by providing special education to

the students of law, adding courses about AI in their syllabus, and giving them training to learn applications of AI in their profession. Using the abilities of our youth will be of greater impact to fill the gap in the profession of law which will also supplement the handicaps of our senior advocates who lack technological awareness.

5. Training and special sessions must be arranged to educate our judges about using AI. Their enhanced expertise will help in providing speedy relief to the aggrieved people thus promoting the rule of law through convenient access to justice. Sought-after results can also be obtained by employing IT experts in courts and administrative sections.

After analyzing the extent of advancement made in the field of law through technology and AI-powered tools it can be conveniently established that measures taken in this regard are highly sufficient as compared to the present and future needs, sustainable growth, and the rapid progress made by other countries in this regard. Challenges responsible for creating hurdles have also been discussed in detail. Pakistan needs massive financial investment to develop infrastructure and equip human capital with the required skills through training, special courses, and education. The involvement of stakeholders and public-private partnerships is also vital for this progressive task. It is necessary to formulate policies and develop effective strategies with a realistic approach without wasting further time.

References

- Abbas, Z. (2024). *The surveillance system keeping tabs on millions*. Retrieved from Dawn:
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1843299>
- Abid, F. (2024). *Pakistan's Draft Artificial Intelligence (AI) Policy: Strengths, Weaknesses, and Implementation Challenges*. Retrieved from <https://strafasia.com/pakistans-draft-artificial-intelligence-ai-policy-strengths-weaknesses-and-implementation-challenges/>

- Ahmed, Z. (2022). *Our Mother tongue*. Retrieved from Pakistan Today: <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2022/04/08/our-mother-tongue/>
- Article 251. (1973). *The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan*.
- Awais, J. (2023). *Legal tech Innovations: Revolutionizing the Practice of Law in Pakistan*. Retrieved from <https://www.bsolpk.org/llm-blog/2023/12/1/legal-tech-innovations-revolutionizing-the-practice-of-law-in-pakistan>
- Barkved, K. (2024). *Artificial Intelligence in Courtrooms*. Retrieved from <https://www.clio.com/resources/ai-for-lawyers/ai-in-courtrooms/#:~:text=AI%20can%20help%20with%20translation,in%20a%20court's%20default%20language>
- BloombergLaw. (2024). *AI-driven Legal Research and Tools*. Retrieved from <https://pro.bloomberglaw.com/products/ai-and-bloomberg-law/>
- BOR. (2024). *Board of Revenue*. Retrieved from <https://bor.punjab.gov.pk/#services>
- CFMS. (2024). *District Courts of Sindh*. Retrieved from <https://cases.districtcourtsindh.gos.pk/>
- Chaudhry, A. (2023). *Punjab police launch AI-powered system to track criminals*. Retrieved from Dawn: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1766810>
- Dawn. (2024). *July-Dec 2023 statistics show 2.26 million cases pending in courts: report*. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1814586#:~:text=Archive%20Flood%20Donations-,July%2DDec%202023%20statistics%20show%202.26,cases%20pending%20in%20courts%3A%20report&text=ISLAMA%20BAD%3A%20The%20Law%20and%20Justice,from%20July%20to%20December%202023>
- DeepL. (2024). *The potential of AI for legal team*. Retrieved from <https://www.deepl.com/en/blog/ai-for-legal-teams#:~:text=Through%20translation%2C%20knowledge%20management%20systems,application%20of%20emerging%20AI%20technologies>
- DRA. (2024). *Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan*. Retrieved from https://www.dra.gov.pk/news_updates/press_releases/introducing-centralized-case-management-system-for-enhanced-efficiency-and-transparency/
- FIA. (2024). *Federal Investigation Agency*. Retrieved from <https://www.fia.gov.pk/>
- Flexman Law Group. (2024). *The Danger of Relying on AI for Legal Advice after an Accident or Injury*. Retrieved from <https://www.floridainjurylawyerblog.com/the-danger-of-relying-on-ai-for-legal-advice-after-an-accident-or-injury/#:~:text=Hallucinations,legal%20claim%20when%20you%20do>
- Garg, M. (2024). *All you need to know about AI adoption in Criminal Justice*. Retrieved from <https://www.techuk.org/resource/all-you-need-to-know-about-ai-adoption-in-criminal-justice.html#:~:text=AI%20and%20the%20Judiciary&text=AI%20helps%20automate%20the%20criminal,those%20wrongly%20accused%20as%20criminals>
- High Court of Sindh. (2024). Retrieved from https://www.sindhhighcourt.gov.pk/cfms/dc_links_conn.php
- Iqbal, S. (2023). *The legal landscape for privacy and surveillance in Pakistan*. Retrieved from <https://www.ibanet.org/legal-landscape-for-privacy-surveillance-in-Pakistan>
- Jatoi, S. K., Khan, D. R., & Jatoi, M. N. (2021). Forensic DNA Profiling and Criminal Justice System in Pakistan: An Analysis. *Pakistan Social Science Review*, 5 (2), 677-693.
- Jerry, L. (2024). *7 Benefits of AI in the Legal*

- Industry. Retrieved from <https://contractpodai.com/news/ai-benefits-legal/>
- Josh and Mack International. (2023). *Legal Advice on Artificial Intelligence Law*. Retrieved from <https://joshandmakinternational.com/artificial-intelligence-law-in-pakistan/>
- Lahore High Court. (2024). Retrieved from https://lhc.gov.pk/case_management
- Laptev, V. A., & Feyzrakhmanova, D. R. (2024). Application of Artificial Intelligence in justice: Current Trends and Future Prospects. *Springer Link* , 4, 394-405.
- Marques, K. P. (2024). *What is Case Management System: Benefits, examples and features*. Retrieved from Clear Impact: <https://clearimpact.com/what-you-should-know-about-case-management-systems/#:~:text=Case%20management%20systems%20are%20software,based%20filing%20systems%20or%20Excel.>
- Naurin, A., & Ullah, A. (2023). *E-Court System: A dire need*. Retrieved from Pakistan Institute of Development Economics: <https://pide.org.pk/research/e-court-system-a-dire-need/>
- Oxford Insights. (2023). *Government AI Readiness Index* . Retrieved from <https://oxfordinsights.com/ai-readiness/ai-readiness-index/>
- Pirzada, M. S. (2023). *Embracing AI in Pakistan's Public Sector Challenges Initiatives, and Future Prospects*. Retrieved from SAFN: <https://southasiaforesight.org/embracing-ai-in-pakistans-public-sector-challenges-initiatives-and-future-prospects/>
- Raja, H. W. (2023). *The AI Regulatory Environment in Pakistan*. Retrieved from RidayTimes: <https://thefridaytimes.com/12-May-2023/the-ai-regulatory-environment-in-pakistan>
- Rauf, S., Ashraf, H., & Sifarish, S. (2024). Factual and Statistical Analysis of Global Rule of Law to establish whether Justice is a Myth or Reality in Pakistan. *International Journal of Contemporary Issues in Social Sciences* , 3 (3), 2095-2103.
- Rauf, S., Rana, A., Anees, A., Ashraf, H., & Sifarish, S. (2023). An Exploratory Research to Analyze Scope of AI-Integration in Legal System and its Probable Challenges with the Way Forward. *Remittances Review* , 8 (4), 4996-5012.
- Rauf, S., Seed, S., & Zahid, A. (2020). Role Of Criminal Investigation In Dispensation Of Criminal Justice: An Analytical Study To Identify Defective Criminal Investigation To Be A Root Cause For Low Conviction Rate In Pakistan. *Webology* , 18 (5), 1623-1639.
- UNESCO. (2023). *AI and the Rule of Law: Capacity Building of Judicial Systems*. Retrieved August 02, 2024, from <https://www.unesco.org/en/artificial-intelligence/rule-law/mooc-judges/#:~:text=Judicial%20systems%20worldwide%20are%20using,sentence%20duration%20and%20recidivism%20scores.>
- WorldAtlas. (2019). *What languages are spoken in Pakistan?* Retrieved from <https://www.worldatlas.com/articles/what-languages-are-spoken-in-pakistan.html>
- Zahid, A., & Rauf, S. (2021). Efforts of pakistan to combat Money Laundering and Terror Financing to get out of "FATF Grey-List". *Pakistan Law Journal* , 1-7.
- Zahid, A., & Rauf, S. (2021). Rape Myth Acceptance by Police: An Underlying Cause for Rise in Number of Unreported Cases of Sexual Assault. *Multicultural Education* , 7 (9), 493-500.