International Journal of Human and Society (IJHS)

P-ISSN: 2710-4966	E-ISSN: 2710-4958
Vol. 4. No. 02 (April-June) 2024	Page 472-480

The Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010: A Milestone for the Provinces



Sana Jabeen Aslam	M.Phil. History Scholar, Department of History and Pakistan Study,	
(Corresponding Author) University of Sargodha <u>sanaaslamrana@gmail.com</u>		
Dr. Zafar Mahauddin	Assistant Professor, Department of History and Pakistan Study, University	
Dr. Zafar Mohyuddin	of Sargodha zafar.mohyuddin@uos.edu.pk	

Abstract: The Eighteenth Amendment in the constitution of Pakistan was enacted by parliament in April 2020. The Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010 marked a significant turning point in Pakistan's constitutional evolution by redefining the federal-provincial relationship. This research article examines the amendment's profound implications for provincial autonomy, fiscal decentralization, and governance dynamics. The Eighteenth Amendment amended 102 articles in the Constitution. This amendment focused the restoration of the constitution, supremacy of parliament and upholding the provincial autonomy. This paper discusses the salient features of the 18th Amendment in this regard.

Keywords: The Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010, The National Finance Commission, Parliamentary Supremacy, 58(2)(B), Concurrent Legislative List, Provincial Autonomy, Federalism

1. Introduction:

In April 1973, the legislature of Pakistan adopted a new constitution to be called as "the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973." This constitution after a number of amendments leads to the 18th constitutional amendment through the Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010.¹

The National Assembly approved the Eighteenth Constitutional Amendment on 8 April 2010 by casting 292 votes in its favour, more than the constitutional requirement of a two-thirds majority. The Senate also approved an amendment to the bill on April 15, 2010. Not a single vote was cast against the said bill, while 90 senators voted for it. Finally, the President assented the amendment on 19 April 2010. After the 1973 Constitution, the political leadership

demonstrated a broad consensus on the 18th Amendment (Mujahid, 2012).

The 27-member Parliamentary Committee on Constitutional Reform was created to remove traces of authoritarianism from the constitution and create a strong, stable legal framework based on consensus. The Council focused on reforms aimed at increasing transparency in the political system, reducing personal bias, strengthening parliament and provincial assemblies, increasing provincial autonomy, protecting judicial independence, strengthening fundamental rights and promoting good governance.

The Committee invites suggestions and proposals from its members and the general public to gather input and consider Private Member's Bills relating to constitutional

.

 $^{^{\}rm 1}$ Act No. X of 2010, published in the Extraordinary Gazette of Pakistan on 20 $^{\rm th}$ April, 2010.

amendments introduced in the Senate of Pakistan.

The committee conducts its procedures behind closed doors, refusing to issue unauthorized press releases. This approach is aimed at creating a favorable environment for open, unhindered discussions on constitutional issues, and developing priorities for the interests of the parties. During its work, the Committee met 77 times and thoroughly reviewed all 280 articles of the Constitution.

Ultimately, the Committee's efforts culminated in the Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment), 2010, which was signed into law on 19 April 2010. This landmark law amends, adds, replaces or deletes Article 102 of the Constitution, which marks an unprecedented overhaul ever happened. In addition to fundamental reforms, this amendment marks a significant achievement for Pakistan by demonstrating broad political cooperation in the country's transition to a federal parliamentary system of government.²

Before the 18th Amendment, the 1973 Constitution contained 280 Articles, 27 Chapters, 5 Schedules and 12 Parts. The 18th amendment was consists of 102 articles, under the 18th Amendment, 120 articles were reviewed, 7 were inserted, 3 were deleted, 20 were substituted, 69 were amended, two scheduled i.e. the Sixth and Seventh Schedules were deleted and the 17th Amendment was repealed.³

2. Salient Features of 18th constitutional Amendment:

Amendment:

2 Imran Ahmed, "The 18th Amendment: Historical Developments and Debates in Pakistan," ISAS Insighta 641 (September 4, 2020): 1–6, 6.

3 "Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010," Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010, accessed May 18, 2024,

https://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/a

Under the 18th Amendment, there were important changes in the political structure of Pakistan. The 1973 Constitution was also amended during the military regime of Ziaul Haq (8th Amendment) and Pervaiz Musharraf (17th Amendment). According to both amendments, the center of power shifted to the hands of military rulers. Their actions then received constitutional protection. The 18th Amendment strengthened the powers of the elected Prime Minister and Parliament. The request for provincial autonomy was met. Regional political leadership has always demanded a flexible constitution in Pakistan.⁴

The main changes brought about by the 18th Amendment are briefly discussed under:

2.1. The Parliamentary Supremacy:

Military dictators in Pakistan have been a major obstacle to the smooth functioning of parliamentary democracy.⁵ A parliamentary system of government was established under the 1973 constitution. The prime minister was the chief executive of the country. The president was the head of state, had ceremonial powers and functions. The 8th Amendment to the Constitution of 1973 shifted some powers from the Prime Minister to the President.⁶

In 1997, the 13th Amendment and the 14th Amendment were passed by Parliament.⁷ The parliamentary system was restored again. During the Musharraf regime, Parliament passed the 17th Amendment. The mentioned amendment strengthened the role of the

mendments/18amendment.html.

⁴ Muhammad Akram and Dr. Asia Saif Alvi, "Provincial Autonomy in Pakistan: With Respect to 18th Constitutional Amendment," *VFAST Transactions on Education and Social Sciences* 10, no. 4 (September 2022): 137–47, 139.

⁵ Hamid Khan, *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2020), 545.

⁶ Shehzaad Nakhoda, *The Eighth Amendment*, accessed May 13, 2024, https://pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/amendments/8amendment.html. See also Fatima Khan, "Why the 18th Amendment Has Become a Cause for Irritation for the Pakistani Army," *ThePrint*, June 12, 2020, https://theprint.in/opinion/why-the-18th-amendment-has-become-a-cause-forirritation-for-the-pakistani-army/440126/.

⁷ National Assembly of Pakistan, accessed May 18, 2024, https://na.gov.pk/en/content.php?id=75.

president.⁸ The revival of the parliamentary system was ensured through the 18th Amendment.

The President's power to dissolve the National Assembly has been revoked. In the past, the President could dissolve the National Assembly under Article 58(2)(B). Before the 18th Amendment, the president could hold a referendum on important national issues. Under the 18th Amendment, the Prime Minister can refer the matter to Parliament. After Parliament's approval, the Prime Minister can hold a referendum. (Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973, Article 48).

2.2. The enhanced role of Prime Minister:

The amendment expanded the powers and functions of the Prime Minister. Before the 18th Amendment, the Prime Minister had to communicate to the President all decisions of the Cabinet in relation to the administration of the affairs of the Federation and bills. According to the 18th Amendment, the Prime Minister shall provide information to the President on all matters within the Federation, relating to foreign affairs and on schemes of law making for the country.9 Under the amended Article 48, there is a ten-day limit on the President to act on the advice of the Prime Minister or his Cabinet. After the amended Article 156, the Prime Minister has the power to appoint four additional members of the CCI. The president does not have the authority to do so. Prior to the amendment, the President had the discretionary power to appoint the Chairman of the Federal Public Service Commission (FPSC). After the amendment in Article 242, the President appoints the Chairman of the FPSC on the advice of the Prime Minister. The electoral authority of the President in this regard has been removed. The prestige of the elected prime minister and the elected chief minister increased. According to the amended Article 153, the CCI is chaired by the Prime Minister. The Chairman of the Public Service Commission at the provincial level is appointed by the Governor on the advice of the Chief Minister¹⁰.

2.3. The Governor:

2.3.1.1. Domicile of the Governor:

18th Amendment made it necessary that a governor shall be a voter member and resident of the province for which he is being appointed so¹¹, this concept was alien to the scheme of constitution prior to the 18th amendment.

2.3.1.2. Advice of the Chief Minister:

Further, article 101 governor was restricted to send the advice of the Chief Minster back for reconsideration before acting on such advice and fixed a time period of 15 days for sending back and 10 days for acting such reconsidered advice. The restricted power to appoint the care-taker government was also withdrawn and entrusted to the chief minister and lead of the opposition.

2.3.1.3. Assent to the bill:

The time period of sanction the bill was reduced to 10 days from 30 days. In case the governor defaults the bill got assented automatically, and

⁸ Ibid

⁹ See Article 46 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973, it reads as "The Prime Minister shall keep the President informed on all matters of internal and foreign policy and on all legislative proposals the Federal Government intends to bring before Majlis-e-Shoora (Parliament)."

¹⁰ See article 242 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973, it reads as "[Majlis-e-Shoora (Parliament)] in relation to the affairs of the Federation, and the Provincial Assembly of a Province in relation to affairs of a Province, may, by law, provide for the establishment and constitution of a Public Service Commission.

⁽¹A) The Chairman of the Public Service Commission constituted in relation to the affairs of the Federation shall be appointed by the President on the advice of the Prime Minister

⁽¹B) The Chairman of the Public Service Commission constituted in relation to affairs of a Province shall be appointed by the Governor on advice of the Chief Minister.

⁽²⁾ A Public Service Commission shall perform such functions as may be prescribed by law."

¹¹ See article 101 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973

in case he wishes to send the bill back to the assembly, he is bound to send it back in 10 days. Once the bill is re-passed or passed with amendment, the governor is bound to assent the same in days, failing which it shall be assented automatically.¹²

2.4. Provincial Cabinet

The total strength of the provincial cabinet has been fixed, which earlier was a discretion of the chief minister. Now the number of Provincial Ministers and Advisors shall not exceed 15 minsters or 11% of the total membership of the assembly. Further, the number of advisors was restricted to maximum of 5 advisors.¹³

2.5. Enhanced role of Parti lament:

The framers of the constitution provided with a strong parliament, however, through subsequent amendments, the military dictators i.e. Zia ul Haq and Pervaiz Mushraf introduced certain amendments who curtailed the powers of the parliament. 18th amendment was purely an attempt to restore the original strong parliament. the enhanced role parliament through 18th amendment can be traced as under;

2.5.1.1. Repeal of 58(2)(B)

A number of presidents have used this provision resulting in multiple dissolutions of the national assembly including notably in 1988,1990,1993 and 1996.¹⁴

However, by the 13th amendment, power given under article 58(2)(B) was abolished. Nevertheless, this resurfaced after a long time when it was reintroduced into the constitution through the seventeenth constitutional amendment.¹⁵

Afterwards, the entire seventeenth amendment was repealed by the eighteenth constitutional amendment thus deleting section A from Article fifty-eight second paragraph.¹⁶

Therefore, now it's solely up to president to dissolve assembly albeit on recommendation from Prime Minister which is a big historic transformation in executive authority within Pakistan's constitutional order.

2.5.1.2. Revision of the Legislative Powers

There were three legislative lists in the original scheme. Federal legislative list was aimed for the departments to be legislated by the Federal legislature i.e. the parliament. The Provincial list was to be legislated by the provincial assemblies respectively. The third list was a residuary list and was called concurrent list.¹⁷ In this list provinces and federation was empowered to legislate. 18th constitutional amendment omitted the concurrent list by repealing article 142(C) of the constitution.

2.5.1.3. Withdrawal of Discretionary Powers

The eighteenth amendment has drastically changed the constitutional powers endowed in the president and governors, and mostly on how they relate to legislative houses. Amendments to articles 63 and 58(2)(B) have eliminated the grip of president or governor over assemblies. The president is now barred from debarring assembly members and dissolving the assembly after the enforcement of the 18th amendment.

Thus, 18th amendment has turned presidents and governors into ceremonial entities in provinces and states thereby moving away from their earlier positions as active players in politics.

2.5.2. Appointment of Acting Governor

After the 18th amendment, the speaker of the assembly assumes the role of acting Governor in the absence of the Governor, without needing to take a new oath. Before the 18th amendment, the acting Governor was appointed by the President. 18

¹² See article 116, ibid

¹³ See article 130 ibid

¹⁴ Kalsoom Hanif and Syeda Fatima Zahra, "ARTICLE 58(2B) AND ITS IMPACTS ON THE DEMOCRATIC GOVERNMENTS OF PAKISTAN," *Pakistan* 59 (March 24, 2022): 93–107, 95.

¹⁵ Ibid, 100.

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ "Concurrent Legislative List," *Brecorder*, April 17, 2010, https://www.brecorder.com/news/3753350.

¹⁸ See Article 101 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973

2.5.3. Appointment of the Judges

The appointment of the judges remained a debatable issue through out the history of the

Article 175A provides the Judicial Commission of Pakistan for the appointment of the judges of the High Courts and for the Supreme Court of Pakistan. This commission is empowered to nominate the candidates to be appointed as a judge. The commission refers the name(s) to a parliamentary committee, which forwards the names to the president and the president cannot reject the names referred to by the commission and committee and he is bound to appoint the persons referred to him.¹⁹

2.5.4. Appointment of the Chief Election Commissioner

Prior to the 18th amendment, the sole appointing authority for the position of the Chief Election Commissioner was president. President used to appoint the Chief Election commissioner at his discretion. But the 18th amendment has provided with a new mechanism. a democratic of appointment the chief election Commissioner. The prime Minister of Pakistan and the opposition leader in the national assembly meets and recommends three names to the parliamentary committee jointed. The Committee is constituted Speaker of the national assembly.

In case of a disagreement of the between the opposition leader and leader of the house, they

¹⁹ "ARTICLE 175(A) appointment of judges.PDF," Supreme Court of Pakistan, accessed May 18, 2024, https://www.supremecourt.gov.pk/downloads jud

gements/all downloads/judicial commission/ARTI CLE_175(A)_APPOINTMENT_OF_JUDGES.pdf.

both severally recommend their own three names each to the committee which shall make a decision thereon, and the decision of the committee shall be final.

The committee, as provided in Article 213 of the constitution, comprises of a total of 12 members. There shall be equal representation of government and opposition in the committee. The 1/3rd of the membership of the committee shall be nominated from the senate.

Prior to 18th amendment the president used to appoint the CEC in an aristocratic manner, now the 18th amendment has replaced the same with a democratic process by giving the power to the chosen representative of the general public.

2.5.5. Care-taker Cabinet

The appointment of the care take cabinet was similar as of the appointment of the chief election commissioner, prior to the 18th amendment. Before the enactment of the 18th amendment the president was empowered to appoint a federal cabinet on his own discretion and the Governor was empowered to appoint a care take cabinet for the provincial government.

The introduction of a proviso in article 224 of the constitution through the 18th connotational amendment have empowered the democratic set up for appointment of the care taker setup.²⁰

Now after the promulgation of 18th amendment the leader of the house and the leader of the opposition i.e. Prime Minister in case of National Assembly and Chief Minister in case of the provincial assembly mutually nominates the Care Taker Prime Minister and Care Taker Chief Minister, as the case may. After such nomination, if agreed, the prime minister

and the Leader of the Opposition in the outgoing Provincial Assembly:

Provided further that if the Prime Minister or a Chief Minister and their respective Leader of the Opposition do not agree on any person to be appointed as a care-taker Prime Minister or the caretaker Chief Minister, as the case may be, the provisions of Article 224A shall be followed;

Provided also that the Members of the Federal and Provincial care-taker Cabinets shall be appointed on the advice of the care-taker Prime Minister or the care-taker Chief Minister, as the case may be."

constitution. The 18th amendments introduced a new provision i.e. Article 175A and amended the existing Articles 175, 176 curtailing the presidential power of the appointment of the judges.

²⁰ It reads as "... Provided that the care-taker Prime Minister shall be appointed by the President in consultation with the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition in the outgoing National Assembly, and a care-taker Chief Minister shall be appointed by the Governor in consultation with the Chief Minister

advices the president to appoint such nominee as care taker prime minister and the chief minister advices to the respective Governor.

The care taker cabinet is appointed by the president or governor on the advice of the respective care taker prime minister or care taker chief minister.

2.5.6. Declaration of the Emergency

The president had an ample power to proclaim the emergency in the provinces. This power of the president has been omitted through the 18th amendment. Article 232 has been amended and a proviso has been added through section 86 of the Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010. The emergency in a province now cannot be imposed without passing of a resolution by the respective provincial assembly in this regard.²¹

The constitution has also provided with the mechanism, in case president proclaims the emergency without the resolution of the provincial assembly, then this act of proclamation of emergency shall be laid before the both houses of the parliament i.e. National Assembly and Senate, who shall have to decide upon the matter within 10 days. This amendment, prima facia, aims to strengthen the federation.

2.5.7. Appointment of Chiefs of Armed Forces

The LFO, 2002²² empowered the president to appoint the Chiefs of the armed forces in Pakistan.²³ Section 90 of the 18th amendment has inserted the words "in consultation with the Prime Minister" in article 243, which makes its mandatory for the president to appoint chiefs of

the armed forcers on the advice of the prime minister.

2.5.8. Deletion of the Sixth and the Seventh Schedule from the Constitution

Prior to the 18th amendment there was a constitutional legislative disparity in shape of the 6th and 7th Schedule of the Constitution. The 18th constitutional amendment has omitted the 6th and 7th Schedule from the scheme of constitution. The 6th Schedule provide with the laws, which were only to be amended with the previous sanction of the President and the 7th schedule had enlisted the laws which were to be amended in a manner as in the manner of the constitution.

2.6. Fiscal Federalism

A brief history of fiscal federalism has been discussed below.

2.6.1.1. The NFC

The paramount aim of the National Finance commission is to distribute fairly between the federation and federating units i.e. the provinces.²⁴ There was a complete halt in the grant of the awards from July 2000 to July 2005. In July 2005 the award was established and the same was announced in 2010. It is pertinent to note that the sixth award which was given in 1996 was not announced thus was expired.²⁵ The NFC is dealt with under article 160 of the constitution.

18th amendment inserted subsection 3A and 3B in article 160 of the constitution. These reads as under

"... (3A) The share of the Provinces in each Award of National Finance Commission shall

²¹ Faryal Nazir, "Constitutional Design of Emergency Provisions: A Comparative Analysis of Pakistan and India," Shaikh Ahmad Hassan School of Law, accessed May 18, 2024, https://sahsol.lums.edu.pk/node/12797#:~:text=Part%20III%3A%20Emergency%20Provisions%20in,the%20President%20in%20his%20discretion.

²² Legal Framework Order, 2002 promulgated by Gen Pervaiz Musharaf

²³ Legal Framework Order, 2002 (Chief Executive's Order No. 24 of 2002), Article 3(1), Sch. item 23(2)

²⁴ Mahira Sarfraz, "NFC Yay or Nay? Dissecting the Debate around the Award," *DAWN.COM*, April 6, 2024,

https://www.dawn.com/news/1822745#:~:text=Ac cording%20to%20Article%20160%20of,Finance%20 Commission%20(NFC)%E2%80%9D.

²⁵ Hamid Khan, *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2020), 603.

not be less than the share given to the Provinces in the previous Award.

(3B)

The Federal Finance Minister and Provincial Finance Ministers shall monitor the implementation of the Award biannually and lay their reports before both Houses of Majlis-e-Shoora (Parliament) and Provincial Assemblies...."

This insertion has fixed the minimum share of the provinces in the NFC. As it is evident that there were certain awards which were not implemented, for that reasons the respective minsters are given with the task to oversee the implementation process of the NFC and report to the parliament, so that effective implantation of the award may be insured.

2.6.1.2. The Council of Common Interests (the CCI)

The CCI is not a new concept in the constitution, it was first established under the first constitution. ²⁶ The CCI is now established under article 153 and 154 of the constitution. The Prime Minister is the chairperson of the council, it comprises of the Chief Ministers of all the provinces and three nominees of the prime minister, nominee shall be a federal minister. ²⁷

The 18th amendment has strengthened the CCI, the council has be recomposed and the prime minister has permanently been made the chair of the council to better regulate the affairs.²⁸ Further the council is now obliged to meet within 90 days regularly. It may be noted that the council met a total of 11 times in toto in 33 years, prior to the 18th amendment and after the 18th amendment, it has met more than 50 times in 14

years.²⁹ 18th amendment has given The council the power concerning supervision, decision making, monitoring and control over the Federal Legislative List-II.

2.6.1.3. National Economic Council

The National Economic Council (NEC) was originally established under the constitution with the Prime Minister as its head. Initially, members were nominated by the President, with at least one member required from each province.

Following the 18th Constitutional Amendment, the council's composition underwent revision. It now includes two members, including the Chief Ministers, from each province, and four members appointed by the Prime Minister from the Federal Government. This amendment has enhanced provincial authority compared to before.

The NEC is mandated to convene biannually. According to Article 156 (5), it must submit an annual report to both houses of Parliament (Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973, Article 156).

The NEC has transitioned from FLL-I to FLL-II. Currently, national planning responsibilities are shared between the Federal Government and the provinces.

3. Conclusion

An analysis of the 18th Amendment shows that the document itself fits a theoretically perfect model of federalism. The problem is that these amendments are meant to compensate for decades of damage done to Pakistan's political situation under various rulers. Some of these damages are very intangible in nature and can only be erased over time. The main obstacle to

by the Prime Minister from time to time."

²⁶ *IPC*, accessed May 17, 2024, http://www.ipc.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/files/CCI/Br ief on CCI [Updated 6 9 2021.pdf.

²⁷ Article 153(2), the Constitution o

²⁸ Prior to 18th amendment article 153(2) read as " (2) The members of the Council shall be-

a. the Chief Ministers of the Provinces, and'

b. an equal number of members from the Federal Government to be nominated

²⁹https://cci.gov.pk/#:~:text=50th%20meeting%20o f%20the%20Council,5th%20August%2C%202023... &text=49th%20meeting%20of%20the%20Council,1 3th%20January%2C%202022... See also *IPC*, accessed May 17, 2024, http://www.ipc.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/files/CCI/Br ief on CCI [Updated 6 9 2021.pdf.

building a democratic government is the political parties that are in power in some provinces. Years of autocratic and dictatorial rule have made the leaders of these parties reluctant to create an environment truly conducive to a perfect model of federalism. This analysis provides clear evidence that the 18th Amendment is a document that supports, provides for and seeks to create a democratic federal system of government in Pakistan.

When it comes to the question of the success of Amendment 18 in creating a federal system of government, it has been found that the amendment was only partially successful. Its success lies in providing the resources, rules, and divisions necessary to create a federal system of government. At the macro level, a truly federal system was created; However, there is no special 150 basis for the federal system at the basic level, failing to fulfill the intended purpose of the amendment. In the past, Pakistan, its people and its power structure have suffered great damage. In a surprising turn in political history, the 18th Amendment succeeded in restoring some semblance of democracy, allowing a democratically elected civilian government to complete its 5-year term for the first time in history in 2018.

References:

- "ARTICLE_175(A)_appointment_of_judges.P DF," Supreme Court of Pakistan, accessed May 18, 2024, https://www.supremecourt.gov.pk/downl oads_judgements/all_downloads/judicial_commission/ARTICLE_175(A)_APPOINTMENT_OF_JUDGES.pdf.
- "Concurrent Legislative List," *Brecorder*, April 17, 2010, https://www.brecorder.com/news/375335 0.
- "Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010," Constitution (Eighteenth Amendment) Act, 2010, accessed May 18, 2024, https://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/const
 - https://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/amendments/18amendment.html.

- Faryal Nazir, "Constitutional Design of Emergency Provisions: A Comparative Analysis of Pakistan and India," Shaikh Ahmad Hassan School of Law, accessed May 18, 2024, https://sahsol.lums.edu.pk/node/12797#:

 ~:text=Part%20III%3A%20Emergency%20Provisions%20in,the%20President%20in%20his%20discretion
- Fatima Khan, "Why the 18th Amendment Has Become a Cause for Irritation for the Pakistani Army," *ThePrint*, June 12, 2020, https://theprint.in/opinion/why-the-18th-amendment-has-become-a-cause-forirritation-for-the-pakistaniarmy/440126/.
- Hamid Khan, Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2020), 545.
- https://cci.gov.pk/#:~:text=50th%20meeting%2
 0of%20the%20Council,5th%20August%
 2C%202023...&text=49th%20meeting%
 20of%20the%20Council,13th%20Januar
 y%2C%202022... See also *IPC*, accessed
 May 17, 2024,
 http://www.ipc.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/fi
 les/CCI/Brief on CCI
 [Updated 6_9_2021.pdf
- Imran Ahmed, "The 18th Amendment: Historical Developments and Debates in Pakistan," *ISAS Insighta* 641 (September 4, 2020): 1–6, 6.
- IPC, accessed May 17, 2024, http://www.ipc.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/files/CCI/Brief on CCI [Updated 6_9_2021.pdf.
- Kalsoom Hanif and Syeda Fatima Zahra, "ARTICLE 58(2B) AND ITS IMPACTS ON THE DEMOCRATIC GOVERNMENTS OF PAKISTAN," Pakistan 59 (March 24, 2022): 93–107, 95.
- Mahira Sarfraz, "NFC Yay or Nay? Dissecting the Debate around the Award," DAWN.COM, April 6, 2024, https://www.dawn.com/news/1822745#: ~:text=According%20to%20Article%20

- 160%20of,Finance%20Commission%20(NFC)%E2%80%9D.
- Muhammad Akram and Dr. Asia Saif Alvi, "Provincial Autonomy in Pakistan: With Respect to 18th Constitutional Amendment," VFAST Transactions on Education and Social Sciences 10, no. 4 (September 2022): 137–47, 139.
- National Assembly of Pakistan, accessed May 18, 2024, https://na.gov.pk/en/content.php?id=75.
- Rana, Afrasiab Ahmed, and Fiza Zulfiqar. "Role of Federal Shariat Court in Islamisation of Laws in Pakistan: A Case Law Study of Leading Cases." *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 2023. doi:10.2139/ssrn.4491926.
- Rana, Afrasiab Ahmed, Fiza Zulfiqar, and Salman Masud. "The Legal and Regulatory Framework for Cryptocurrency and Fintech in Pakistan: Challenges and Policy Recommendations." *UCP Journal of Law & Legal Education* 2, no. 1 (2023): 01-27.
- Rana, Afrasiab Ahmed, Usman Ayaz Gujjar, Fiza Zulfiqar Ahmad, and Ahmad Hassan Khan Naul. "Admissibility and Evidentiary Value of Electronic Evidence in Criminal Cases: A Case Study of Pakistan." JL & Soc. Pol'y (2022): 27.
- Shehzaad Nakhoda, *The Eighth Amendment*, accessed May 13, 2024, https://pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/amendments/8amendment.html.
- Zulfiqar, Fiza. "Global cobweb Cybercrimes in the borderless world A comparative perspective with special reference to USA, Canada and Pakistan." *Pakistan JL Analysis & Wisdom* 1 (2022): 65.
- Zulfiqar, Fiza. "The Transgender Persons (Protection of Rights) Act, 2018: A literature Review of Prominent Literature." *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom* 2, no. 00 (2023): 35-48.