

EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN'S PUNJAB: OUTCOMES AND CONCILIATIONS

Sadia Habib

Abstract

One of the most basic difficulties Pakistan faces today is the need to improve and grow its schooling framework. With significant political and segment changes occurring, more noteworthy devolution and fortified majority rule government, this is a helpful second to manufacture a superior framework. Not exclusively does the motivation behind instruction must be characterized past what has been left over from pilgrim authoritative goals, yet a lot more noteworthy exertion must be put resources into building up the abilities and gifts of most of the populace.

Punjab, Pakistan's biggest territory, has taken a few schooling change activities to improve training results. Anyway about a fourth of young kids are as yet not going to class either on the grounds that they never selected or on the grounds that they exited early. Low change rates to auxiliary training are of exceptional concern. Additionally, late appraisals have demonstrated that understudies' information and cognizance of fundamental subjects remains alarmingly low. Improved learning in schools is in this manner another significant test. Examples in learning accomplishment in Punjab demonstrate the significance of school level components, suggesting that a decent school could compensate for other local and financial incongruities. Better quality schools additionally draw in more understudies from the most unfortunate families, since when guardians anticipate better gets back from training, the time and assets spent on tutoring gets advantageous. This paper will survey the degree to which basic holes in accomplishment levels and other instructive results have been tended to by past approaches and current change programs.

Catchphrases: Instruction, tutoring, Pakistan.

JEL order: I21.

1. Introduction

Practically 50% of Pakistan's populace is uneducated and a fourth of young youngsters don't go to class. The issue of nonattendance is generally intense in country territories and for young ladies. The low need given to instruction

* Senior Individual, Community for Exploration in Financial matters and Business (CREB), Lahore School of Financial aspects, Pakistan. The creator might want to express gratitude toward her associates Anum Bukhari and Asha Gul for their help and Shehryar Nabi for help with altering. is reflected in the way that Pakistan spends just 2 percent of its Gross

domestic product on this area—among the most minimal levels in non-industrial nations. Indeed, even these restricted assets are not spent effectively since learning accomplishments for most of understudies are beneath standard. Since 40% of the populace is under 15 years of age, upgrading their abilities and prosperity is one of the nation's most significant difficulties. With the solidification of majority rule government following the May 2013 decisions, an extended, excellent instruction framework turns out to be significantly more dire to empower the nation to push ahead in its social and monetary turn of events.

This examination gives an outline of tutoring in Punjab, Pakistan's biggest territory and home to right around 60% of its populace. Area 2 examines the vision that builds up the setting for a nation's schooling framework. Segment 3 blueprints Punjab's schooling accomplishments. Segment 4 presents a structure for evaluating the significant mediations attempted to improve instruction results, and notes where progress has been made and which issues need consideration. Area 5 finishes up the investigation.

2. An Schooling Vision and its Usage

During the nineteenth century, numerous nations that are currently viewed as evolved, dispatched state funded training to impart a feeling of public attachment among their residents and build up the essential aptitudes needed by recently industrializing economies. Varieties in schooling frameworks arose out of nations' exceptional institutional and social foundations (Cummings, 2003). For example, Japan underscored schools essentially to plan mechanical specialists instead of creating singular ability. England's schooling framework began with the target of advancing an exclusive class, and Germany's more concentrated framework advanced early spilling in essential and center school to create particular aptitudes. Most agricultural nations with pilgrim foundations acquired the frameworks their rulers had presented.

In 1947, Pakistan and India acquired a pioneer framework intended to get ready government and armed force officials to work for their English rulers. While the motivation behind this training framework for the Subcontinent was clear, Pakistan still can't seem to characterize an away from target of schooling. A strategy goal of putting resources into training to build up the fundamental aptitudes of all residents for monetary and social advancement actually must be obviously expressed and actualized by the bureaucratic and common governments. It is possible that this absence of a reasonable vision has brought about the public authority's inability to submit consistently to putting resources into training and improving results. Pakistan's enlistment rates fall behind those of its South Asian neighbors (Figure 1). Such low enlistment rates have genuine ramifications for the province's improvement destinations.

An occasion to build a dream for schooling exists in the continuous decentralization measure in Pakistan. Expanding on the underlying decentralization of commonplace managerial structures in 2001, the eighteenth Amendment to the Constitution in 2010 has completely degenerated

schooling and wellbeing to the territories. With the exclusions of the simultaneous rundown in the constitution, common governments are currently answerable for training arranging, strategy, educational plans, and guidelines. Every territory needs to build up its own financial plan and activity plan for instruction, and the commonplace schooling and law divisions are answerable for drafting enactment to execute the new regressed structure.¹

Instruction is likewise necessary by law unexpectedly. Article 25-An of the eighteenth Amendment expresses: "The State will give free and obligatory schooling to all offspring of the age of five to sixteen years in a way as might be dictated by law." The Punjab training office has drafted a "Right to Instruction" bill (2013), which is as of now being introduced to the Punjab government for endorsement; common enactment on the execution of

Concerns about guaranteeing least educational plan norms without uniform guidelines have prompted proposals about a potential government part in observing instruction. A choice suggested by the Report of the Parliamentary Board on Sacred Changes was to put educational plans under the order of the Gathering of Normal Interests or Government Administrative Rundown Part II.

Article 25-An is still pending.² To actualize Article 25-A, commonplace governments should expand their schooling financial plans and deal with the Public Money Commission grant efficiently.³

Exploration in instruction changes consistently underscores that just spending more cash on training and on building educational systems doesn't really prompt better learning and improved specialist profitability (Pritchett, 2001). The advancement effect of interests in schooling relies upon administration structures, the degree of interest for recently created aptitudes, and the nature of instruction conferred.

Then again, in a similar investigation of India and China, Dreze and Sen (2013) contend that state interest in instruction and wellbeing is the way to expanded profitability, development, and improvement. As per the creators, most of the populace—particularly the least fortunate gatherings in the public arena—acquires from consumptions on wellbeing and training rather than spending on wasteful, inadequately focused on sponsorships on things, for example, diesel fuel.

A remarkable element of Pakistan's schooling framework is the ascent of minimal effort private tutoring, especially in Punjab (involving up to a fourth of complete enlistments), mirroring the critical interest for instruction. Guardians may lean toward non-public schools for a few reasons: they might be found nearer to home, particularly for young ladies at the essential level; instructors go to class all the more regularly; and the nature of educating at the center and optional levels—when assessment planning gets significant—is probably going to be better (Ahmed, Amjad,

Habib, and Shah, 2013). The nature of instruction is, in general, moderately better in tuition based schools; they additionally work all the more proficiently since instructors' compensations mirror their exhibition and the expense of training is significantly lower than in state funded schools (Andrabi, Khan, Khan, and Naseer, 2012). Additionally, non-public school graduates in Pakistan are assessed to procure more than their partners in Bangladesh, showing that the administrative system might be more helpful for working tuition based schools in Pakistan (Asadullah, 2009). These bits of knowledge from the experience of non-public schools can help detail strategies pointed toward conveying compelling tutoring in the public authority area.

The Territory of Schooling in Punjab

Contrasted with different areas, Punjab has the most elevated interest rates among young kids (Figure 2).⁴ There are as of now around 60,000 government schools and 35,000 tuition based schools in Punjab, spread across 36 locale. Government schools are managed at the locale level, and regions are additionally partitioned into tehsils and bunches. One instruction area official for every region gives the primary regulatory connection to the commonplace government and assumes a key influential position in the conveyance of training. Training area officials are helped by at least two aide instruction officials.

Punjab's intricate instruction authoritative structure, notwithstanding, has delivered helpless results. Low enlistment rates (reflecting youngsters who have never gone to class just as early dropouts), low degrees of learning in schools, lacking admittance to tutoring for young ladies, and helpless change to center and more significant levels of instruction are of specific concern. In addition, the most unfortunate family units and southern regions show minimal quantities of youngsters enlisted.

Interventions and Outcomes

The limited success in education is not for want of reforms. Several education programs and policies have been introduced since independence in 1947. In a review of the history of national and provincial education policy and reform in Pakistan, Bengali (1999) gives a comprehensive list of the many intended programs designed as a matter of bureaucratic routine, whose targets and goals were seldom met.

While the bulk of education funding continues to be on salaries and infrastructure, recent initiatives in Punjab's education policy are aimed more consciously at increasing student enrollment and learning. Current donor and government programs in education revolve around access, quality, and governance, and several innovative schemes have

been introduced for better delivery of these outcomes. Section 4.1 presents a framework for assessing recent interventions (policies, programs, and projects) aimed at improving Punjab's education outcomes.

A Framework for Assessing Interventions

Various school and household characteristics play a role in aiding or constraining educational goals. Influences at home as well as school can have an effect on whether students enroll in the first place, how well they learn, and if they stay in school. A child's innate talents and his/her home and school environments—in which learning takes place—are also important determinants of educational achievement.

Figure 8 presents a broad framework for looking at supply- and demand-side influences on educational outcomes identified by the education literature. Demand-side influences include household income, parents' education, distance from home, number of siblings, and job opportunities. Supply-side influences include investment in textbooks, school buildings and facilities, teacher training, availability of jobs, and higher education opportunities. Children's school attendance depends, therefore, on whether

(i) their households can afford to send them to school, (ii) schools are available close by and it is safe to travel there, and (iii) parents value the education offered by these schools. A child is more likely to remain in school if (i) high-quality middle and secondary schools are accessible, (ii) his/her parents can continue to afford their child's education, (iii) the school environment is satisfactory, and (iv) teachers are present. All these factors are influenced by the common platform of the regulatory, governance, and financial structures in which education delivery takes place.

Request and flexibly factors are likewise interrelated. For instance, the quality and sort of tutoring and instructor accessibility will impact guardians' interest for training—helpless guardians probably won't think of it as advantageous to dedicate their kids' time and family unit assets to low quality tutoring that isn't seen to grant preferable aptitudes or work openings over could be picked up without the schooling. Understudy participation and inspiration to concentrate additionally relies upon the nature of guidance, the school climate, and head initiative.

Numerous investigations have recognized different interest and flexibly factors clarifying instructive accomplishment. In the prior writing, guardians' financial status was given as one of the significant explanations behind putting resources into training. Resulting examines have underscored the part of school data sources, for

example, educator preparing and school foundation (Orazem and Ruler 2007; Glewwe and Kremer, 2006). For Punjab's elementary schools, significant interest side elements affecting school investment and execution incorporate neediness and the separation to class. Notwithstanding, understudy execution differs the most across schools and not across less fortunate or more extravagant areas. This infers that improving school-level elements could help defeat a portion of the interest side imperatives related with families' lower financial levels (Das, Pandey, and Zajonc, 2006; Andrabi, Das, Khwaja, Vishwanath, and Zajonc, 2007; Andrabi et al., 2012).

Punjab Instruction Change Activities

The Punjab Schooling Area Change Program (PESRP), which began in 2003, has embraced significant interests in instruction. Subsidized by the World Bank and the UK Office for Global Turn of events (DFID), the PESRP utilizes payment connected pointers to dispense assets on the satisfaction of at any rate eight out of ten such concurred markers. The Punjab government meets the majority of the PESRP's expense (about USD 3.5 billion) with help from benefactors, primarily the World Bank (USD 350 million) and DFID (USD 200 million). The PESRP was presented with three overall objectives: improving access, quality, and administration in training. A reverted managerial structure with expanded focusing of instructive consumptions to more unfortunate families was likewise arranged. Be that as it may, the program's overall effect has not been huge: the enlistment patterns given in the past area show deteriorating essential and center school enlistments over the change time frame, with just auxiliary school young ladies' enlistments expanding in certain years.

The Punjab Schools Change Guide was started in 2010 under a more extensive DFID-financed program, detailed particularly as a system to facilitate the conveyance of instructive outcomes under the PESRP. The program's managerial structure includes monitoring progress on the training results of schools and locale, and the outcomes are accounted for straightforwardly to the main priest of Punjab each a few months. Under the guide program, a huge ascent in the quantity of school visits by observing groups has improved understudy and instructor participation in the two years that it has been actualized (Stylist, 2013).

The earnest methodology taken under the guide relies upon the responsibility of the most elevated level authorities. Should this responsibility fade, there might be a droop in schooling results if the framework depends too intensely on the guide structure. Also, positioning execution by regions might be deceiving if there is wide variety among schools inside regions (Andrabi et al., 2012). A more intensive gander at these varieties over

schools is significant in clarifying why a few schools perform in a way that is better than others and in utilizing these current instances of what functions as principles for development as opposed to depending on normal locale level execution.

Be that as it may, the guide has made a dataset of schools and an observing framework to kick off the Punjab educational system into performing better. It gives a valuable generally speaking structure in which the subtleties of instructor, subject, and educational plan quality can be worked out as long as exorbitant political weight isn't forced on regions to compel results out of schools and understudies—a cycle that ordinarily requires some serious energy.

As referenced before, pay rates and actual foundation ingest the heft of government financial plans, for the most part practically ruling out exploring different avenues regarding creative projects. Giver helped programs permit adaptability to attempt new mediations to improve instruction; in view of their outcomes, these changes can be scaled up and new strategies presented. Significant change activities can be surveyed in the general system of components affecting instruction results.

Request Side Activities

On the interest side, arrangements being followed incorporate the young ladies' allowance program, school vouchers, and restrictive money moves (CCTs) under the Benazir Pay Backing Project (BISP)— an enormous scope social assurance program focusing on ladies in low-pay family units and at present coming to up to 4 million families in Pakistan.

Female Auxiliary School Payment Program

This program was presented as one segment of the PESRP in 2004, intended to improve female enlistments by tending to the interest side requirements of moderateness and separation. The payment was actualized in 15 regions with low female proficiency levels and young ladies in evaluations 6–8 were granted a money move of PRs 600 at regular intervals on the off chance that they met the 80% school participation measure. Since separation to class has been distinguished as a significant imperative, the program was likewise intended to urge guardians to spend on moving young ladies to class. In 2006, the allowance program was stretched out to secondary school young ladies and the measure of the payment has additionally been expanded. Chaudhury and Parajuli (2010) show that enlistments for auxiliary school young ladies may have expanded by 9–20 percent, contingent upon the information sources. Notwithstanding, the creators don't locate any huge improvement in learning among young ladies in the allowance areas.

This plan tends to the destitution limitations looked by guardians and is intended to draw in out-of-younger students. Begun in 2006, the voucher program was set up by the Punjab Training Foundation,⁸ created because of the achievement of ease private tutoring in Pakistan, particularly in Punjab. Under this plan, understudies who might some way or another not have the option to bear the cost of instruction can utilize vouchers of up to PRs 350 to go to non-public schools. Extending the voucher plot is required to expand enlistments. Notwithstanding, in contrast to schools in the private area, the voucher conspire involves managerial exertion and cost to screen learning appraisals and distinguish meriting understudies and key school areas to get vouchers.

An investigation on guardians' view of school decision finds that a unit increment in use on private tutoring comparative with public tutoring diminishes the likelihood of female enlistments in tuition based school by 13 percent. For guys, this factor is immaterial in clarifying school decision. This suggests that the expense of tutoring is a vital factor in choosing the kind of school for young ladies, however not for young men (Ahmed et al., 2013). An augmentation of the voucher plan could be utilized to focus on a higher extent of young ladies since the exploration demonstrates that guardians are happy to spend more on young men's schooling.

Waseela-e-Taleem

The Waseela-e-Taleem program was dispatched under the BISP in 2012. The program intends to help select out-of-younger students and urge families to keep tutoring the individuals who are as of now enlisted. A recipient family is qualified for a money move of PRs 200 every month for up to three youngsters on gathering the affirmation necessities of a confirmed school and satisfying a 70 percent least quarterly school participation standard. In January 2013, around 50,000 families were taken a crack at the program and it is assessed that by 2015 in excess of 2 million kids will be enlisted (Nabi, 2013). Utilizing a staged execution approach, the program will be tried in chosen locale and scaled up dependent on the consequences of the pilot. A thorough assessment of the program has been incorporated into the BISP's execution structure yet the consequences of the principal period of testing are not yet accessible.

Establishment Helped Schools

As a public-private organization activity under the Punjab Training Establishment, "establishment helped schools" were intended to fulfill the expanded need for private tutoring under the Instruction Voucher Plan. These schools are observed for quality confirmation and public appropriations are proceeded based on schools accomplishing a base breeze through rate after two assessment adjusts. An effect assessment of the activity from 2008 to 2011 found that enlistment in establishment

helped schools had expanded by 40% and that understudy accomplishment had improved by what could be compared to one to two extra long periods of tutoring. Significant expansions in learning were seen between the two test adjusts because of the weight of a high-stakes test (Barrera-Osorio and Raju, 2010).

Report Cards and Understudy Learning Appraisal

The PEC has been attempted understudy learning appraisals for grades 5 and 8 since 2003, made obligatory from 2005 in all private and state funded schools. Punjab is the principal territory to dispatch an enormous scope appraisal program. In an investigation joining 2009 information on school attributes with PEC scores, Andrabi et al. (2012) endeavor to connect understudy execution to class inputs. The creators discover varieties at the school level to be significant in clarifying contrasts in understudy accomplishment: "The hole among great and awful region is moderately more modest contrasted with the hole among great and terrible schools inside some random region." Variables related with better understudy execution are lower understudy instructor proportions, better-taught and more experienced educators, and better school offices, for example, chalkboards. Besides, regions with higher enlistments don't really have better kid learning results.

The variety in quality across schools calls for more prominent spotlight on school-level factors that could help clarify why some administration and non-public schools are superior to other people and how the attributes of these schools influence learning.

Medium of Guidance

The consequences of the PEC tests show language accomplishment test scores to be especially low. The absence of a reasonable language strategy has likely detrimentally affected learning. The Punjab government reported an approach of English-medium guidance at the essential level in 2006 to address parental interest, checked by the expanded interest for non-public schools offering guidance in English. Government schools and educators were not ready for this radical strategy change: instructors' information on English was restricted and course books and educational programs were not produced for showing subjects in English. Because of this arrangement, math and science instructors began requesting to be changed to showing Urdu in light of their absence of English abilities (Bari, 2013). In excess of 50 dialects are spoken across Pakistan and a more clear language strategy in schools is required dependent on an agreement of perspectives and neighborhood demand.¹⁰

Guardians request English-medium training mostly for its apparent convenience in admittance to openings for work and in lessening social disparity. Simultaneously, public and indigenous dialects are viewed as a significant piece of having a place with a network and of an understudy's personality (Ahmed et al., 2013; Rahman, 2010). As opposed to taking part in enthusiastic discussions, it is imperative to find a way to create language preparing offices and educational plans that fuse in any event two dialects (English, Urdu, and a nearby language) in school guidance to advance significant learning.

Introduction of High-Stakes Testing

To improve the nature of learning, critical weight is given to PEC test scores in positioning regions and supporting sponsorships for establishment helped schools. In any case, the disservices of high-stakes testing have been appeared to empower showing a barely engaged educational program that underscores test readiness. Educational systems have additionally would in general keep scholastically more fragile understudies from sitting high-stakes tests (Figlio and Getzler, 2006). Better assessment of the PEC evaluation framework is needed to guarantee that testing isn't outfitted to satisfying basically administrative and political points and that it is utilized to improve understudies' subject information and scholarly abilities.

10 The experience of different nations with multilingual foundations could be helpful in building up a language strategy for the mode of guidance. For example, India follows a "three-language equation" (Annamalai, 2001) and in a few non-industrial nations where there is an interest for skill in English, schools have bilingual language arrangements (Garcia, 2008; Klaus, 2003).

School Gatherings and Head Educator Initiative

A few examinations underline the significance of flexibly side school-related elements in access and learning. As a component of the devolution program and trying to include networks in school the executives and responsibility, 56,000 school chambers were framed in 2009. These chambers get yearly awards to improve school framework. Board individuals involve the head instructor, guardians, and nearby residents who screen the presentation of educators and school results; the head educator is given a conspicuous part in this. Yearly awards going from PRs 20,000 to PRs 50,000 are given at different tutoring levels to address the necessities of specific schools. As a stage toward more noteworthy spotlight on exercises and structures inside schools, reinforcing school boards and directing examination on activities at the school level would help recognize a portion of the attributes that exacerbate schools better or.

School Climate

Guardians' interest for tutoring and understudies' inspiration to learn and proceed with their schooling is affected incredibly by the nature of schools accessible. Significantly more consideration should be centered around exercises and structures inside schools. An intercession under the Private-Public Association program tended to the issue of repetition learning and low guidelines in schools by presenting a "youngster neighborly" class climate (Naseer, Patnam, and Raza, 2010). Educator and chief preparing was offered two times every year, and specialized help gave all through the school year. Materials, for example, crystals and building blocks were likewise given and exercises, for example, book making and sensational play presented. Schools where the mediation was acquainted were found with have higher learning scores than no program schools.

Curriculum Guidelines and Inclusion

A vital gracefully side limitation in giving better-quality training is a proper educational program. A work to increase expectations by building up an improved school educational program was attempted in 2006 at a public level; since devolution, the territories have actualized a few changes from the new educational plan. In any case, issues related with educational plans, as distinguished in a few exploration contemplates, still can't seem to be tended to. Studies on Africa and South Asia (counting Pakistan) show that covering an excessive amount of material excessively fast can adversely affect total understudy learning. Thus, understudies don't dominate the rudiments regardless of quite a long while of guidance (Pritchett and Beatty, 2012). Not exclusively is it accordingly essential to build up an elevated expectation educational program, however it is additionally critical to pace the guidance of class materials for kids to have the option to dominate fundamental ideas in rudimentary evaluations.

Concluding Comments

In spite of the fact that Punjab has further developed instruction framework than different territories, the vast majority of its kin remain inadequately taught notwithstanding various training arrangements and changes. All things considered, about a fourth of young kids are not selected, less young ladies than young men go to class, and learning results are insufficient. Expanded consumptions are needed to meet the expense of an extended and improved educational system, yet acquiring more cost in itself isn't probably going to yield positive outcomes without better administration and a more clear vision of the objectives of schooling.

The way toward regressing schooling to common and area governments by means of the eighteenth Amendment to the Constitution gives an occasion to move administration and authoritative structures in training nearer to the networks that will profit by them. Guardians' interest for quality instruction is reflected in the fast spread of private tutoring all through the nation for groups of all pay levels. Devolution is required to help articulate the reason for instruction to all the more adequately coordinate the gracefully of training with interest for the huge quantities of kids needing tutoring inside the variety of Pakistani ethnic and topographical settings.

Significant interests in training are right now occurring under the PESRP and Punjab Schools Guide. The expressed objectives of access, quality, and maintenance can be surveyed inside a system of family, school-, and network level factors that influence these objectives. The instruction writing demonstrates that, on the interest side, neediness stays a mind-boggling imperative to class participation in Punjab. Tutoring quality, school area, and instructor presence influence guardians' choice to send their kids to class. Significant flexibly issues incorporate suitable and great educational programs, the presence and adequacy of educators, and effective school the executives.

Past activities in instruction were driven by consumption on school foundation with restricted assessment of results. Ongoing change programs have consolidated exercises from past disappointments, for example, the SAP, and are intending to fabricate better observing and administration structures that incorporate understudy appraisals. Then again, a superior assessment of past approaches is required as they are actualized. Under the PESRP, the arrangement of agreement employing was racked regardless of positive outcomes in educator participation and understudy accomplishment. Instead of tending to the execution issues and natural inconsistencies in strategy plan that were causing educator disappointment, political weight prompted the approach being deserted out and out and all agreement instructors being regularized.

Various instruction change activities are presently in advancement in Punjab. A portion of these, for example, the young ladies' optional allowance program, have been halfway effective in that enlistments and participation levels have improved subsequently. Learning levels, nonetheless, have continued as before. Expanding merit-based voucher and CCT projects to young ladies may help address the issue of lower female support and improve learning.

To address the issue of low learning guidelines, an imaginative in-administration instructor proficient advancement program has been presented, and testing happens routinely in evaluations 5 and 8 to screen understudies' advancement. Understudy and educator participation just as grades have improved since 2011, basically because of better management and observing.

Notwithstanding, these evaluations include high-stakes tests that connect understudy and instructor execution to prizes and disciplines for educators and schools. This makes motivations for encouraging a barely engaged educational program pointed toward "instructing to the test" and for gaming the framework by barring inadequately performing understudies. Math and language abilities stay low, as measured by free assessments, for example, ASER (2013) and the official Punjab Training Office insights.

Research studies on Punjab's educational system and evaluations of similar reform initiatives in other countries point to a number of factors that need to be addressed to remedy poor learning levels. These factors could be incorporated in the several innovative approaches currently in place under the PESRP and Punjab Schools Roadmap such as lesson plans, public-private partnerships, teacher in-service mentoring, and school councils.

1. Existing lesson plans in earlier grades should be modified to ensure that students master basic concepts and build a solid educational foundation. This will require considerable effort by teachers and school administrators as well as parents, to ensure teacher presence in the classroom, teacher competence in subject knowledge, and the ability to create a comfortable and inclusive learning environment for students.
2. Classes usually have a student mix of different ages and competency levels. Remedial programs may be required to ensure that the majority of students are receptive to teaching at grade-appropriate standards.
3. Exam results show low proficiency in students' language competence. Further policy debate and research is required to develop a multilingual policy incorporating English, Urdu, as well as local languages. This would fulfill multiple aims of education by increasing employment opportunities while remaining integrated with national and local identity and culture.
4. Less emphasis on high-stakes assessments will take pressure off district administrators and teachers to achieve results quickly under threat of dismissal, transfer, or lack of financial rewards. Testing should be geared to raising actual learning levels.

Few rigorous evaluations of educational initiatives have been conducted for programs implemented in Punjab and in Pakistan. For greater accuracy in assessing program results, baseline data needs to be collected on variables of interest and other factors that might influence outcomes; the counterfactual also needs to be built for meaningful comparison of results. Revisions in implementation and policy design can be based on these evaluations.

Educational investments show results over time. Education budgets usually suffer cutbacks along with other public sector development programs during periods of economic downturn. To prevent the early dissipation of educational benefits, investments in education have to follow overall school, district, provincial, and national goals and continue over a period of time despite political and economic setbacks.

References

- Ahmed, H., Amjad, S., Habib, M., and Shah, S. A. (2013). Determinants of school decision: Proof from rustic Punjab, Pakistan (Working Paper No. 01-13). Lahore, Pakistan: Community for Exploration in Financial matters and Business.
- Councilman, H., Orazem, P. F., and Paterno, E. M. (2001). School quality, school cost, and the general population/non-public school decisions of low-pay family units in Pakistan. *Diary of HR*, 36(2), 304–326.
- Andrabi, T., Das, J., and Khwaja, A. I. (2010). *Instruction strategy in Pakistan: A structure for change: An arrangement brief*. London, UK: Worldwide Development Place.
- Andrabi, T., Das, J., Khwaja, A. I., Vishwanath, T., and Zajonc, T. (2007). *Learning and instructive accomplishments in Punjab schools (Jumps): Bits of knowledge to advise the training strategy banter*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Andrabi, T., Khan, S., Khan, Y., and Naseer, M. F. (2012). *Learning in state funded schools* (Working Paper No. 12/0390). London, UK: Worldwide Development Community.
- Annamalai, E. (2001). *Overseeing multilingualism in India: Political and semantic signs*. New Delhi, India: SAGE.
- Yearly Status of Training Report. (2012). *Yearly status of instruction report: ASER-Pakistan 2011*. Lahore, Pakistan: Creator.
- Yearly Status of Instruction Report. (2013). *Yearly status of instruction report: ASER-Pakistan 2012*. Lahore, Pakistan: Creator.